

- Program* (Washington, DC: USAID Migration Policy Institute, 2010); Laura Hammond et al., "Cash and Compassion."
13. Goodwin, *Citizens of Nowhere*, 183.
 14. *Ibid.*, 185, 230.
 15. *Ibid.*, 266
 16. For example, in his 2008 research, Hoodfar finds that while Afghan refugee youth remain loyal to their families and communities of origin, they often seek to challenge the dominant ethnic/clan ideologies underpinning these social institutions, believing that clan affiliations "contradict a sense of equity and citizenry." Homa Hoodfar, "The Long Road Home: Adolescent Afghan Refugees in Iran Contemplate 'Return,'" in *Years of Conflict: Adolescence, Political Violence and Displacement*, ed. Jason Hart, Studies in Forced Migration (Portland, OR: Berghahn Books, 2008), 185.
 17. Roger Zetter, "Labelling Refugees: Forming and Transforming a Bureaucratic Identity," *Journal of Refugee Studies* 4, no. 1 (1991).
 18. Goodwin, *Citizens of Nowhere*, 8.

Robyn Plasterer holds an MSc in Refugee and Forced Migration Studies from the University of Oxford and has worked with various refugee education and resettlement programs in Canada for over five years. In 2009, she travelled to Dadaab and Kakuma refugee camps to conduct research and provide pre-departure orientations for students resettling to Canada. She is currently involved with refugee education projects at UNHCR Headquarters in Geneva.

Dual Disasters: Humanitarian Aid after the 2004 Tsunami



Jennifer Hyndman
Kumarian Press, Sterling, VA, 2011. pp. xvii, 171.

Jennifer Hyndman sets an ambitious goal in this slim volume, nothing less than a re-examination of the way in which humanitarian aid is provided in the light of the increasing complexity of humanitarian disasters. The international response to the tsunami, which struck countries around the Indian Ocean on December 26, 2004, provides the starting point for her analysis, but the scope of the book is broader than the impact of the tsunami alone. The bulk of the empirical material comes from Sri Lanka and the Indonesian province of Aceh, both locations where terrible devastation as a result of the tsunami coincided with ongoing separatist conflicts. This combination of political and environmental emergencies leads to the characterization "dual disasters" that forms the central theme of the book. This clear, straightforward term encapsulates a complex and detailed argument and is sure to be widely cited.

The core of the argument is that environmental emergencies and politically focused conflict have much in common and (in contrast to the common characterization of specifically natural disasters) both may be exacerbated by human action. The notion that there is no such thing as a purely natural disaster is now widely accepted but it is given new force here through the comparison of Sri Lanka and Aceh. In Aceh, the tsunami was a "key catalyst" (p. 105) for a peace agreement which ended the decades long conflict and still holds. In Sri Lanka, in contrast, the central agreement to

deliver assistance to areas of the country controlled by the Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam broke down. The tsunami was followed by a gradual resumption of conflict which escalated to a catastrophic end in 2009 with what an official UN report has since estimated was as many as 40,000 civilian casualties.

Systematic comparative analysis of the two contexts is deliberately avoided. Hyndman anticipates and avoids any potential criticism that she is using the nation-state as a unit of analysis, which such a comparison would inevitably involve. Rather, she emphasizes the significance of scale, incorporating multiple scales into her analysis, from the individual human body (an analysis of the changing status of widows) to global political economy (discussion of the securitization of international aid). All of the analysis is empirically informed, including interviews with many of the key participants. The policy context is a key component of this analysis so there are obvious conclusions for policy—the inequality of responses received by individuals caught up in the different disasters, for example. Yet policy analysis is not the principal aim and the key questions are of a more theoretical nature. This approach is engaged since it seeks to address the context in which particular policy approaches are conceived rather than the policies themselves. Hyndman's critical engagement has become a

hallmark of a style of critical, feminist geographic practice which Hyndman has done much to popularize.

This is Hyndman's first research monograph since *Managing Displacement: Refugees and the Politics of Humanitarianism* (Minneapolis: Minnesota University Press, 2000). That book, based on research with refugees in Kenya and Somalia, introduced a geopolitical analysis to the field of refugee studies through a "transnational geopolitics of mobility" (p. 58) that has proved extremely influential. In some senses *Dual Disasters* can be seen as a follow-up: geopolitical analysis, political engagement, and questions of humanitarian action remain central. Yet given these similarities, it is the distinctions between the two books that are more instructive, charting important developments in the humanitarian environment that have occurred in the intervening years.

One of the most notable differences between the two books is the role of UNHCR. The earlier book was targeted directly at the UN refugee agency, whereas it is barely mentioned in *Dual Disasters* (it does not even appear in the index). This is partly an indication of the broader scope of *Dual Disasters*, which considers the politics of aid delivery across the whole spectrum of international and national NGOs and various other international organizations such as IOM and UNICEF. It also relates to the contrasting theme; in the post-tsunami setting, UNHCR had a more limited role and operated in a more crowded field beyond its traditionally assumed role of refugee support. This new emphasis reflects the changing landscape of aid (or "aid scapes" as they are widely referred to in the book) as other actors have become more significant in international responses to displacement. This increasingly neo-liberal environment of competition in the provision of aid is assessed in detail in Chapter 5 ("Acts of Aid") in the context of Sri Lanka.

Since the publication of *Managing Displacement*, Hyndman has cemented her reputation as one of the most original commentators in the field of geopolitics. Her contribution has refined a specifically feminist geopolitics, which forms an important strand of analysis in the book. Chapter 4, for example, examines the ways that the tsunami has transformed the institution of widowhood in Sri Lanka. This builds on a suggested transformation in classic "Gender and Development" frameworks to incorporate "Feminism and Development" or "Feminism and Disaster" approaches. The feminist approach expands the focus on gender to an intersectional analysis of disadvantage and inequality that encompasses not only gender roles but religion, ethnicity, class, and location within Sri Lanka, amongst other things.

This intersectional approach supports a critique of Naomi Klein's analysis of "disaster capitalism" that is first

raised in the introduction and further considered in an assessment of the geopolitics of fear in Chapter 3. Klein's critique of post-tsunami policy development as focused on the interests of a global capitalist class is usefully complemented by Hyndman's more detailed assessment of the competing forms of nationalism, geopolitical interests, and "humanitarian hubris" which help explain why the patterns of development predicted by Klein during her 2005 visit to Sri Lanka have largely failed to appear. Of the remaining chapters in the book, Chapter 2 provides the only comparative element to the book, with examinations of the historical background to conflict in Sri Lanka and Aceh, and Chapter 6 (written jointly with Arno Waizenegger) returns to Aceh with a more critical account of the post-tsunami peace process that has failed to provide the promised "peace dividend" for many rebel fighters.

In a book as wide-ranging yet as concisely presented as *Dual Disasters* there are inevitable sins of omission. More could have been made of the role of UNHCR in disaster relief, for example, particularly at a time of significant introspection within the organization about its mandate. Given Hyndman's previous landmark work in this area this is a surprising omission; examination of UNHCR's role in Aceh would also have supported the argument about the disparity of treatment received by conflict-displaced and tsunami-displaced people that is central to Chapter 6. A second point is that since the tsunami, one of the most notable trends in the geopolitics of international aid has been the continued emergence of relatively new donors, most obviously India and China. Although the significance of China's investments in Sri Lanka is highlighted in the introduction there seemed to be more opportunity for a re-evaluation of Mark Duffield's critical characterization of the "liberal power" of international aid in the chapter on the securitization of aid, particularly following the failure of Western governments to coerce the government of Sri Lanka into a ceasefire in the closing months of the war, as the terrible human cost was becoming apparent.

Yet to address all these points would have required a longer, denser book. One of the book's virtues is the clear, concise approach to the complexity behind the "dual disasters" of the title. It is the nature of dual disasters themselves which is the main contribution to the book. The introduction considers a number of other situations, particularly the 2010 earthquake in Haiti. The conclusion emphasizes that the likely progression of climate change will make dual disasters more likely as existing conflicts are increasingly overlain with environmental disasters. Through the intervening consideration of both Sri Lanka and Aceh it becomes apparent that the distinction in the impact of the tsunami, between war and peace, which initially appeared

obvious, is much less clear. Outcomes for individuals in both contexts were determined more by the tendency to

respond separately, and often unequally, to the combination of emergencies constituting these dual disasters.

MICHAEL COLLYER

Michael Collyer is Senior Lecturer in Geography at the University of Sussex, Brighton, UK.

To Feel at Home Abroad or No Place Like Home: Meanings of Displacement in Refugee Studies

~
Nergis Canefe

Reviewed Books

What Has Become of My Life? The Silenced Voices of Refugees in Japan,
by Erdal Doğan and Tsuyoshi Amemiya.
197 pp. Paperback. Tokyo: Kinkoh Printing, 2008.

Driven From Home: Protecting the Rights of Forced Migrants,
edited by David Hollenbach.
296 pp. Paperback. Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press, 2010,
ISBN: 9781589016460 (1589016467).

Conceptualising "Home": The Question of Belonging among Turkish Families in Germany,
by Esin Bozkurt.
243 pp. Paperback. Frankfurt and New York: Campus Verlag Press, 2009, ISBN: 9783593387918.

Refugees, Asylum Seekers and the Rule of Law: Comparative Perspectives,
edited by Susan Kneebone, Monash University, Victoria.
341 pp. Hardback. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009, ISBN: 9780521889353.

Refugees who have lost their original homes often find themselves traumatically detached in their new environment despite resettlement. Under these circumstances, their natal or lost home assumes a new significance for the sense of belonging and their need for being reconnected and recognized with dignity. In the context of refugeehood, "home" is not only a physical manifestation of identity. In their country of asylum, in essence refugees try to re-establish a lost grounding by reclaiming and reconstructing their sense of belonging.

Three of the four books reviewed here conceptualize the meaning of "home" embraced by refugees and migrants in innovative ways, though they put emphasis on different aspects of the phenomenon. The picture they create proposes that there are at least four different aspects to be considered: material, spatial, socio-political and personal. Of those four,

the last two assume paramount importance in the long term. Namely, for refugees in particular, the combined sense of attachment, belonging, and rightful ownership, as well as recognition or denial of past traumatic experiences inflicted by the loss of home have a direct impact on the acquisition of a sense of attachment to a new home.

In *What Has Become of My Life?*, for instance, Erdal Doğan and Tsuyoshi Amemiya examine the underbelly of the Japanese human rights regime and treatment of asylum seekers in Japan. In a genre that is becoming quite commonplace in the field, they collect first-hand oral narratives of refugee experiences in Japan, and how the issue of being kept in limbo for years and spending inordinate amounts of time in detention while one's refugee application is being processed renders the meaning of "home" moot for asylum seekers in Japan. The range of topics covered in this volume